Live Learning Experience: Beyond the immediate response to the outbreak of COVID-19

Local public services: keeping frontline workers safe

Briefing & Learning Note
May 13th, 2020
Launched jointly by United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG), Metropolis, and UN-Habitat on March 25th, 2020, the #BeyondTheOutbreak Live Learning Experience (LLE) virtual sessions aim to bring together Local and Regional Governments (LRGs), their associations, and partner organizations to allow and promote meaningful exchange as they find themselves confronting the COVID-19 crisis while maintaining an orderly functioning of public services. Following an initial consultation held during the launching session, the eleventh thematic LLE, held on Wednesday 13 May and organised with the support of Public Services International (PSI), explored how local and regional governments were addressing the continuity of local public services while keeping frontline workers safe.

Nearly 200 participants attended the session, in which representatives of local and regional governments and workers’ unions shared their experiences of confronting the challenges posed by the crisis while seeking common ground and shared solutions. These included interventions from the cities of Goyang, Nur-Sultan, Ouagadougou, the Barcelona Provincial Council and the local government association of Brazil (CNM), as well as trade union representatives from Italy (CGIL Funzione Pubblica), the UK (UNISON), Brazil (SINDSEP-CUT), Denmark (HK Kommunal), France (CFDT Interco) and Tunisia (UGTT Municipaux). A representative of the International Labour Organization (ILO) also joined the second panel and Metropolis’ General Secretary made concluding remarks on the whole session. Throughout the session, a parallel chat discussion thread allowed participants to share comments, resources and make recommendations.

The magnitude and rapidity of the COVID-19 outbreak entailed that our societies and institutions were not adequately prepared to face the crisis. Yet, local and regional governments have stepped in to ensure the continuity of public services, with local public service workers fully carrying out their duties in spite of the challenges and concerns posed by their exposure to contamination risk for themselves and their families.

Public service workers deliver several essential services that are critical to protect communities through the crisis and halt the spread of the virus. **Water and sanitation workers** provide clean water for drinking and for handwashing, one of the essential viral barriers. **Energy workers** ensure that hospitals can operate life-saving devices, as well as that the confined populations can cook, heat or cool homes, work remotely and keep in touch with their loved ones. **Waste services workers** safely collect and dispose of contaminated medical waste and household refuse, while disinfecting public spaces. **Social service, home care and disability care workers** support the most vulnerable, breaking the isolation of the elderly and tackling the specific challenges of disabled populations.

**Firefighters, ambulance crew and emergency workers** are often the first to handle sick patients and transfer them to hospitals. **Public transport workers** allow essential workers to
get to work. **Municipal police workers** control public spaces to ensure that social distancing rules are enforced by educating the public and dispersing groups. As death tolls rise, **body handlers and burial services workers** have the tremendously difficult task of taking the dead with dignity and accompanying families through the grief, while keeping the public safe from contagion.

Moreover, as millions of people - amongst which many public service workers themselves - are losing their jobs and risk forced evictions, **public and social housing workers** support families, homeless people and other people in precarious situations including migrants and refugees, at the same time that **public administration workers in unemployment and social security services** are working around the clock. While vital public service workers are on the front line of the fight against COVID 19 and schools are closed, many school support, **childcare and crèche workers** continue to provide essential minimum services for their colleagues. In the context of the current pandemic we are currently facing, the crucial question to ask is: what can we do to ensure the crucial continuity of public services, necessary for the protection of the population as a whole, while effectively protecting the lives and health of public service workers who provide those services?

**Local and regional governments, COVID-19 and public service provision: challenges and opportunities**

An online consultation was carried out during the session, in which almost 50 participants shared their various experiences and highlighted shared concerns and recommendations. When asked what they thought are the main challenges frontline LRG workers face in the Covid-19 pandemic, respondents’ answers may be grouped into 7 categories of priority challenges. **Frontline workers’ safety** emerged as the biggest challenge, followed by **resources** as the second biggest concern and frontline workers’ **stress**, which is mentioned in third place.¹

---

¹ Related keywords Q1: health, security, protection, exposure, risk, disease; Q2: PPE and equipment; Q3: overload, fatigue, fear, pressure, sanity, threat; Q4: solidarity, discrimination, visibility, harassment, isolation; Q5: no voice; Q6: wages, unemployment, precariousness; Q7: fake news, knowledge.
Respect came fourth in terms of being a key concern, followed closely by concerns regarding the lack of social dialogue, working conditions and access to reliable information for frontline workers having to deliver local public services during the pandemic.

Participants were then asked which local public services they considered were most under pressure in the current emergency. Among the seven available options, social services, home and disability care topped the ranking of the most pressured services, which can be understood as these services are critical to support the most vulnerable in communities, for whom receiving assistance in the face COVID-19 becomes a matter of life or death. These are followed by ambulance crew, firefighters and emergency responders, which are the first service workers having to intervene first to take people in critical health conditions to the hospital or even to remove corpses from households or public spaces before they are handed to burial services. Public/social housing and shelters come next as it is not possible to implement self-quarantine and proper lockdown measures if populations do not have access to adequate housing. Water, sanitation and energy utilities are key to permit handwashing and break the contamination chain, while energy keeps hospitals and other vital human activities going, such as cooking, heating, producing and communicating. Waste services followed, as it is necessary to remove and dispose of contaminated medical and household refuse, while also keeping the public space safe. Municipal police and burial services came next, as their workers are having to ensure safety and distancing rules are respected and that dignified burials to COVID-19 victims are provided. Lastly, participants were asked what they thought is needed to ensure strong local service provision to confront future crises. The overwhelming majority of participants’ answers revolved around the need to have strong local municipal finances, followed by social dialogue and better working conditions for public service workers. Participants also highlighted the role played by planning/preparedness capacities, followed by trust in the public sector/service and governance as key pillars for building up preparedness to future crises.

Ensuring public service continuation: Adapting services, reorganizing public service workplaces, meeting new challenges.

The pandemic and the consequent lockdown measures have forced LRGs to rapidly adapt their public services’ delivery to the emergency. Armand Roland Pierre Béouindé, Mayor of Ouagadougou, illustrated with the city’s experience how LRGs have taken measures to apply social distancing, digitalise services and apply safety measures in their interactions with citizens and users. They are reorganising workplaces, encouraging remote work, adjusting staff levels, training and re-deploying workers across sectors to comply with health and safety rules, all while trying to provide appropriate Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) to frontline staff so they can properly do their jobs while keeping the public, themselves and their families safe.

---

2 Of a total of 47 responses, 19 pointed at the most recurrent dimension raised (related keywords: resources, investment, budget, money, no tax havens), 8 at the second (consultation/collaboration with workers’ representatives, decent work, better wages, more staff, occupational health and safety); 6 at the third (information, training, clear strategy, science-based), 5 at the fourth (support to the public, public services delivered by the state) and 5 at the fifth issues pointed out in the text above (decentralisation, subsidiarity,
Pilar Díaz, Deputy Councillor for International Relations of the Barcelona Provincial Council and Mayor of Esplugues de Llobregat shared that in her municipality, many services have been digitised and procedures mainstreamed. This includes the changing of working times and shifts but also the adaptation of workplace layouts and the acquisition of new IT equipment. The same applies to the progressive lift of the lockdown, as services need to be adapted to operate as the virus is still in circulation. Participants identified two different sets of challenges. On the one hand, Bekturova Malika Yerlanovna, Deputy Mayor of Nursultan, illustrated that public administration workers who are in the frontline need to be provided with adequate PPE, resources and capacity, so as to help reduce stress and fear these workers are experiencing. However, she noted how it is critical to understand that in order to address such a vital concern, the commitment of municipalities is key but also is the support of the national government. On the other hand, there is the novel necessity to regulate work from home for those who are able to do so. As Octavi de la Varga, Secretary General of Metropolis, pointed out, most local government administrations had never dealt with such a phenomenon, which indeed represents a significant organizational and infrastructural challenge. He stressed that these issues have often never been discussed with the unions and human resources departments, sharing that only in Spain, the percentage of remote work for public administration workers has increased from 9% to 35% over lockdown time.

Participants also shared their concerns regarding the lack of financial and human resources, which has been a constant challenge throughout the crisis. Mads Samsing, EPSU LRG Standing Committee Chair and HK Kommunal Vice Chairman, argued that in many countries, the austerity measures implemented after the 2008 financial crises put the public sector in a difficult budgetary situation. The lack of resources, capacity and staffing levels that have become apparent during the Covid crisis were actually pre-existent and public administrations were already suffering. Moreover, municipalities’ revenues mainly come from local businesses, tourism, consumption, property and parking -- all of which being activities that have been severely affected by the crisis. Therefore national governments need to support municipal income to ensure service continuation.

During the session, it was also highlighted how the current crisis has unveiled how many LRG jobs and functions are essential to the well-functioning of our societies and how these need to be adequately resourced and staffed to ensure the safety of all. Octavi de la Varga, Secretary General of Metropolis, added that there are many services, beyond the ones that are being more visible in the outbreak of the pandemic, that are essential to keep our cities, municipalities and local governments going -- also including public service workers which are outsourced to private providers and who face often worse working conditions.3 He stressed that, even if working for private companies, these workers should be fully considered as public service workers as they deliver public services.

3 Such workers referred to in contributions from participants include, but are not limited to, social protection programmes workers; water, waste and sanitation workers, particularly in countries with poor access to safe sanitation and hygiene; public communications offices to share COVID-19 information with people and experiences with other governments at all levels; public transport services that ensure the mobility of essential workers who are at great risk. Also, correctional services, who protect inmates housed in confined spaces conducive to contagion and court systems, which are needed need to prevent discrimination, abuse of technological monitoring and address employment and financial disputes.
Protecting public service workers’ health and safety

Strong occupational safety and health and decent working conditions for LRG workers are a critical factor to ensure public service continuation, adaptation and resilience at times of Covid. Rosa Pavanelli, General Secretary of PSI, explained that in order to safely confront the emergency and serve their local communities, workers need to feel they have the adequate protection and information and must not have to worry about feeding their families, paying rent and securing income. In spite of the many challenges, public service workers have answered the call to frontline duty in the Covid emergency. In the words of Mi-Jeong Park, Senior Specialist at Goyang City, this commitment needs to be backed by efforts from all levels of government, which have to work together to ensure proper conditions for them to work safely. Carlos Carrion-Crespo, Public Service and Utilities Specialist at the ILO added that municipalities employ many health workers and other first responders who cannot abandon their work, but should not be forced to engage in excessive risks either. That is a necessary bond of trust that has to be established if workers have to go to the frontline with confidence.

Resource shortages have translated into contamination and deaths of LRG frontline workers. Makrem Amaria, General Secretary UGTT Municipaux, Tunisia, explained that where the decentralisation process has translated into stronger autonomy of municipalities but has been unmatched by adequate financial and human resources needed to fulfil these local government mandates - such as in Tunisia - there have been steep increases in municipal workers’ workplace accidents and professional illnesses.

There is a need to collect accurate statistical data and to recognize the occupational safety and health (OSH) rights and needs of all LRG workers. Many frontline workers deaths have gone unnoticed or unrecorded due to a lack of awareness and of recording tools. For instance, Juneia Batista, Head of the National Women Secretariat of the national Brazilian trade union center CUT, stressed that there have been many casualties among burial service workers in Brazil. The recognition of their critical role and of the risk they are exposed to has come late, nearly 2 months after the outbreak in Brazil. Makrem Amaria, General Secretary of UGTT Municipaux confirmed a similar situation in Tunisia. Here municipal workers’ unions and mayors joined forces to urge the Tunisian national government to take action and provide PPE to burial workers.

Policy coherence, proper planning and dialogue across public services and between local and central governments are key. Jon Richards, Head of Local Government at British public service union UNISON, shared the example of UK public service workers sent back into duty while public transport frequency is still as low as during lockdown and the PPE and testing shortage continues, meaning that public service workers going back to work are at again at risk. He stressed that clear, science-based evidence over the virus and regular communication with public service workers’s unions has proven essential to build the trust workers need to go back to work with confidence. Carlos Carrion-Crespo, Public Service and Utilities Specialist at the ILO, stated that unions play a fundamental role in making sure that public service workers receive correct and clear information regarding the pandemic. Furthermore, he
requested that LRG employers provide appropriate OSH training and adequate information and ensure they engage in ongoing dialogue with workers’ representatives.

Jon Richards stressed that **public service staff redeployment must come with adequate training and conditions** otherwise it can be very risky and workers can get severely injured or die (e.g. street sweeping is different from operating a refuse truck and serious accidents have occurred). The fact that **volunteers in emergency must not replace core public service, professional work** said Jon Richards, who further explained that unions have asked the UK government to limit and even stop bringing volunteers to the Covid frontline as their lack of experience and training puts them at risk and can further increase workload for frontline emergency workers. Octavi de la Varga added that often volunteers are deployed to cover up for the lack of workforce in certain areas, and must be trained and capacitated to avoid volunteers to become additional victims in the fight against COVID-19.

**Participants also debated about how** the pandemic is an opportunity to enforce and put in practice the ILO Guidelines on Decent Work in Public Emergency Services elaborated by a Tripartite ILO Experts meeting in 2018. This is a good tool that can help and guide LRG social partners to deal with this and future crises. Adopted in 2018, they contain proposals for action to provide employment stability, workplace safety, health guarantees and social protection to public emergency workers, including volunteer workers, so they can dedicate all their energies to protecting communities. They also provide recommendations for social dialogue, training and inter-agency coordination so public service workers can share their knowledge, have a voice in their work environment and be fully prepared to confront the growing threat of disasters, epidemics, climate change and violent acts. Participants shared their vision regarding **turning the challenges posed by Covid in public services into an opportunity to build a culture of OSH and dialogue at LRG workplaces**. In such sense, Makrem Amaria, General Secretary UGTT Municipaux, highlighted that in Tunisia, the Covid-19 pandemic has created the conditions for rising awareness over the importance of local government workers’ OSH, not only among Tunisian mayors and authorities, but also among the municipal workers themselves.

“There is a need to recover trust in the public sector - we have been told for decades that the private sector is more efficient, costs less and provides better quality, but then when something like a pandemic strikes we all resort to public service provision.” Emilia Saiz, UCLG Secretary General.

**Social dialogue between local government authorities and workers’ unions: a key pillar for an effective response to the crisis**

Social dialogue and collective bargaining have proved the best way to successfully deal with the health emergency, ensuring the continuity of effective public service provision while keeping workers safe. As was put by Mads Samsing, EPSU LRG Standing Committee Chair and HK Kommunal Vice Chairman, public service workers at all hierarchical levels and their unions have an in-depth knowledge of the service and of the reality on the ground that is
essential to build the expertise that local and regional authorities need to ensure public service continuation amidst the crisis. LRGs should therefore exchange information and engage into constructive dialogue with LRG workers’ unions. This applies also to the re-opening process where social dialogue, information and consultation are going to be essential to prevent a second wave of the pandemic while continuing good service provision.

Nicoleta Grieco, Head of International Office at CGIL Funzione Pubblica, shared that in Italy, social partners reached an early agreement among the national government, both public and private employers and public service unions, negotiating a nation-wide framework agreement to deal with the crisis. This agreement was signed on March 14 and set the guidelines to ensure workers and service users’ safety. This same agreement provides the framework for the reopening process. Italian public service union federations also negotiated and signed sectoral agreements with specific protocols for service continuation and workers OSH in the waste and the public administration sectors. These agreements dealt in detail e.g. with the safe removal and disposal of medical waste, with the digitalisation of public administration and slimmer procedures and made a PPE an entitlement for all workers.

Carlos Carrion-Crespo, Public Services and Utilities Specialist at ILO, issued his concern that the current crisis must not be a justification to skip or bypass social dialogue, rather the contrary. Due to the crisis, some national and local governments have bypassed existing social dialogue structures and practices. Some central governments have especially adopted a top-down approach in taking and rolling out Covid-related measures without proper consultation with workers’ representatives. This lack of a proper social dialogue is unhelpful, undermines good public service provision and can pave the way for conflicts in the future.

Participants pointed out, instead, that moments of crisis are precisely the time when social dialogue must be reinforced. Dialogue between LRG governments and workers’ unions can take place at levels that go beyond the local one and help articulate partnerships and joint demands towards national governments, international institutions as well as other relevant actors and stakeholders. As LRG Sector social partners at the European level, EPSU and CEMR will shortly issue a joint declaration directed to the EU and national governments to warn against repeating austerity measures implemented in 2008, calling instead for the allocation of adequate economic resources to municipalities and regions that are necessary to maintain basic services that respond to needs of citizens and residents. At a global level, PSI and UCLG can partner together to ensure that all local government workers - including outsourced ones - can access decent working conditions and OSH, for instance through public procurement specifications and by ensuring local government authorities take closer control and oversight over tendering processes.

#BeyondTheOutbreak: how to safely lift lockdown measures and build up cities’ and territories’ preparedness for future crises

Post Covid-19 policies and future preparedness measures have to analyse and draw lessons
from the challenges and shortcomings of the current crisis, as this will be an essential stepping stone to move towards more resilient, sustainable and fairer cities, communities and societies. In this sense, a key lesson raised during the session was the failure of global supply chains to deliver vital supplies such as PPE equipment and intensive care devices in the crisis. As said by Rosa Pavanelli, PSI General Secretary, many local governments have responded to the pandemic - especially where national level coordination response has been poor - by relocating production, which can be a way to foster local economic development while stockpiling life-saving materials critical for future pandemic preparedness.

She also highlighted another key point shared by many participants afterwards, which is how investing in stronger local public services, bringing back public services back into governments’ hands (“remunicipalization”) and avoiding cutting public budgets and staff as much as possible, are critical conditions to build up our cities’ and regions’ preparedness for future crises. The well-functioning of public services is key when it comes to recovering from the health crisis and avoiding a deep economic and social crisis. Municipalities and regions are suffering great economic losses due to Covid-19, and without a consistent allocation of economic resources, there is a risk they will be unable to continue to provide quality services to their communities. Mads Samsing, Denmark’s EPSU LRG Standing Committee Chair and HK Kommunal Vice Chairman, stressed how local and regional governments have been operating under very difficult economic and financial contexts for many years, which has undermined their capacity to react to the current crisis now. He pointed at how structural reforms and austerity policies implemented in the years following the 2008 financial crisis have had a negative impact on the quality and resilience of public services as in some countries, local and regional governments were the most heavily affected by cuts out of the whole public sector -- with austerity measures casting a particularly negative impact on women.

In interventions throughout the whole session, participants agreed that a key learning from the crisis must be internalized if we are to strengthen our cities’ and regions’ preparedness for the future and agreed it is of critical importance not to repeat the post-2008 crisis austerity and cuts approach in the aftermath of the COVID-19 outbreak. The allocation of economic resources to municipalities and regions will also have a positive impact on job retention and creation in local communities that will help reduce the socio-economic impact of the crisis. Socially and environmentally responsible public procurement is a key tool to prompt a sound recovery. Municipalities and regions are large employers and of great importance to the local economies and communities, and the largest share of publicly procured goods and services is carried out at a local government level. Thus LRGs can influence the quality and quantity of jobs in private businesses through socially responsible public procurement.

Another message that was strongly echoed throughout the whole session was that, in order to strengthen cities’ and regions’ capacities to face future crises, local governance needs to be improved and the value of local public services properly acknowledged. As stressed by Jon Richards, Head of Local Government from the UK’s UNISON, policy coherence, proper planning and dialogue across public services and between local and central governments are key. Reforms and resources are needed to strengthen LRGs’ capacity to provide not only frontline public services but also planning to reinforce territories’ resilience, as
well as increased administrative and fiscal autonomy. Moreover, on the side of public service workers, it is necessary to properly acknowledge their work and contribution, which includes ensuring safe and decent working conditions. Along similar lines, other participants such as Bernard Dreno, Occupational Health and Safety Specialist from France’s CFDT Interco federation, stressed how the crisis has shown the urgent need to systematically learn the collective lessons from the crisis to strengthen preparedness and contingency plans for the future. This requires a review of the public service organization, which could start by keeping the joint local government employer-worker crisis management units that were set up during the pandemic.

Participants also stressed the importance of harnessing the momentum to build a culture of OSH in public service workplaces and providing adequate training to all LRG workers. Covid-19 is still among us and will be so for a long time. Therefore, it is essential that the re-opening is done in a slow and controlled manner, ensuring minimisation of risks to citizens and workers. During the re-opening, there must be a strong focus on occupational health and safety. Municipal workers’ skills in the field of occupational health and safety must be strengthened to ensure the effective application of standards and reduce risks. Moreover, participants also shared consensus on how implementing regular LRG social dialogue and collective bargaining at all levels is a crucial foundation to build up preparedness for future crises. Again, they brought to the forefront how the years following the 2008 crisis also entailed a serious setback for social dialogue in many countries, a reduction of collective bargaining, and consequent weakening of the social protection levels that would now contribute to mitigate the COVID-19 crisis’ pernicious effects. Furthermore, as emphasized by Octavi de la Varga, Metropolis Secretary General and by Carlos Carrión Crespo, ILO’s Public Services and Utilities Specialist, properly acknowledging LRG public service workers beyond the crisis frontline ones will be key for our societies to effectively recover from the pandemic and build the foundation to the strong public services our world needs.

Key lessons learnt and ways forward

1. In the face of the COVID-19 outbreak, local and regional governments have stepped in to ensure the continuity of public service provision and fill in the gaps and shortcomings in national government responses, which was made possible by public service workers’ efforts and dedication to duty and community service.

Local and regional governments play a key role in ensuring the accessibility, quality, regularity of service and affordability of service provision for all populations. Following the COVID-19 outbreak, LRGs have made significant efforts to overcome the many challenges faced and ensure the continuity of public service provision, essential in protecting all populations amidst the current crisis. Doing so has been possible thanks to the daily work of public service workers, who have continued to undertake their tasks and serve their communities in spite of the OSH challenges and contamination risks for them and their families.

2. Ensuring the protection of public service workers is critical to address the current emergency, as well as to advance towards more inclusive, safe, resilient and
sustainable cities and human settlements (SDG11).

Adequately protecting the public service workers that are carrying out their vital daily tasks in the frontline of the fight against COVID-19 is a sine qua non condition to overcome the pandemic. The current crisis also entails a window of opportunity to trigger systemic and political change. Participants from LRGs, their associations and from workers’ unions shared the commitment to seize the spotlight in which the current crisis has put local public service provision to push for the proper acknowledgement of their vital importance of public services and of the people working to ensure their provision. Such acknowledgement serves as the basis of a solid partnership and joint actions calling for more autonomy and resources at the local and regional level to strengthen public service provision including by securing workers with adequate equipment, training and decent working conditions.

3. Social dialogue between local authorities and public service workers’ representatives as the foundation to ensure the continuity of effective service provision while keeping frontline workers safe.

The experiences shared throughout the session demonstrate that the Covid-19 emergency can only be managed cooperatively through constructive dialogue. This applies to the national government level as well as to the local and regional government level. The fundamental human rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining must be upheld at all times, including in times of crisis. Local and regional governments should therefore engage into dialogue with public service workers’ representatives to identify challenges and find common strategies to keep all frontline workers safe while ensuring that cities and territories keep functioning. Such a dialogue-driven approach has manifold strengths and reflects the democratic mindset of local authorities, at the same time it is the only way to guarantee that a whole-of-society approach is adopted to overcoming the current emergency.

Resources

- PSI “Sanitation workers play a key role to break the contamination chain” https://bit.ly/36rsgel
- ILO International Labour Standard on Employment and Decent Work for Peace
and Resilience Recommendation

- ILO International Labour Standard on Occupational Safety and Health Convention

- Guidelines on decent work in public emergency services

- ILO Sectoral Brief: COVID-19 and public emergency services

- Specific ILO Instruments:
  
  (a) Convention on Labour Relations in the Public Service, 1978, No. 151
  
  (b) Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise, 1948 (No. 87);
  
  (c) Convention on Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining, 1949 (No. 98)
  
  (d) Hygiene (Offices and Commerce) Convention, 1964 (No. 120)
  
  (e) Hygiene (Offices and Commerce) Recommendation, 1964 (No. 120)
  
  (f) Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155)
  
  (g) Employment and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience Recommendation, 2017 (No. 205)
  
  (h) Recommendation on Violence and Harassment, 2019 (No. 206)
  
  (i) Convention on Labour Administration, 1978 (No. 150)